United Nations A/HRC/WGAD/2014/57

General Assembly

Distr.: General
7 May 2015
English
Original: French

Human Rights Council
Working Group on Arbitrary Detention

Opinions adopted by the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention at its seventy-first session, 17–21 November 2014

No. 57/2014 (Lebanon)

Communication addressed to the Government on 25 June 2014

Concerning Mohammed Ali Najem and 71 other detainees in the Nahr al Bared camp case

The Government has not replied to the communication.

The State is a party to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.*

1. The Working Group on Arbitrary Detention was established by the former Commission on Human Rights by its resolution 1991/42. The mandate of the Working Group was then clarified and extended by the Commission by its resolution 1997/50. The Human Rights Council assumed the mandate by its decision 2006/102 and extended it for a three-year period by its resolution 15/18 of 30 September 2010. The mandate was extended for a further three years by resolution 24/7 of 26 September 2013. Acting in accordance with its methods of work (A/HRC/16/47, annex), the Working Group transmitted the above-mentioned communication to the Government.

2. The Working Group regards deprivation of liberty as arbitrary in the following cases:

(a) When it is clearly impossible to invoke any legal basis justifying the deprivation of liberty (as when a person is kept in detention after the completion of his or her sentence or despite an amnesty law applicable to the detainee) (category I);

(b) When the deprivation of liberty results from the exercise of the rights or freedoms guaranteed by articles 7, 13, 14, 18, 19, 20 and 21 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and, insofar as States parties are concerned, by articles 12, 18, 19, 21, 22, 25, 26 and 27 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (category II);

* The State became a party to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights on 3 November 1972.

GE.15-09134 (E) 190515 260515

1509134

Please recycle

(c) When the total or partial non-observance of the international norms relating to the right to a fair trial, established in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and in the relevant international instruments accepted by the States concerned, is of such gravity as to give the deprivation of liberty an arbitrary character (category III);

(d) When asylum seekers, immigrants or refugees are subjected to prolonged administrative custody without the possibility of administrative or judicial review or remedy (category IV);

(e) When the deprivation of liberty constitutes a violation of international law for reasons of discrimination based on birth; national, ethnic or social origin; language; religion; economic condition; political or other opinion; gender; sexual orientation; or disability or other status, and which aims towards or can result in ignoring the equality of human rights (category V).

Submissions

Communication from the source

3. This case was submitted to the Working Group on Arbitrary Detention in the following terms.

4. According to the source, 87 people were arrested by the Lebanese army intelligence services during clashes in the Palestinian refugee camp of Nahr al Bared between May and September 2007. The Lebanese army started bombing the camp on 20 May 2007 and then entered it on 15 July 2007, to fight alleged members of the armed group Fatah al Islam. This communication concerns only 72 of those people (see annex), who are being held in Roumieh prison, either serving a prison sentence (or in one case awaiting execution under a death sentence), or awaiting trial. Of the other 15 persons arrested, one was never charged and was eventually released and another was convicted but has already served sentence and been released. The other 13 people were released on bail pending trial.

5. According to information received, some of the people alleged to have been arbitrarily detained were arrested during the evacuation of the civilian population of the camp, either at the army checkpoint or in their homes; the others were arrested after these events, in some cases as late as 2009. According to the source, the arrests were made without a warrant and with no explanation of the reasons, and for the most part by members of the military intelligence services.

6. The source alleges that, after their arrest, all the suspects were taken to the Ministry of Defence for questioning and that all, without exception, have reported undergoing serious acts of torture intended to make them confess that they were members of Fatah al Islam (a suspected radical armed group) or had direct or indirect ties with that group. All later said that they had been tortured into signing statements containing admissions that they had been directly involved in the clashes. On 7 June 2007, the Council of Ministers ordered those arrested to be brought before the Justice Council.

7. The source reports that, on appearing before the military court, most of the victims reported torture and other ill-treatment after arrest but none of them was allowed to lodge a complaint or to challenge the confessions extracted under torture, or even to challenge the lawfulness of their detention, even though they had been held incommunicado for long periods without the right to see their families or a lawyer.

8. According to information received, a judicial investigation was ordered on 20 August 2007. The investigating judge then regularized the arrests and pretrial detention after the fact by issuing arrest warrants. The source states that the investigation was based solely on the statements drawn up by the army intelligence services, which contained the

accused's confessions obtained under torture and which were contested by the accused themselves at the hearing before the investigating judge; the judge disregarded their challenges and upheld the measure of pretrial detention.

9. According to information received, the investigation ended in December 2007 but the judge did not draw up the final indictment until 19 July 2012. Pretrial hearings were held at Roumieh prison in February and March 2013 and chaired by the President of the Justice Council. In order to expedite proceedings, the judge decided to sever consideration of the case by grouping the defendants according to the charges against them.

10. The source reports that on 27 September 2013 a first group of accused was for the first time brought before the trial court (Justice Council) and that in May 2014 12 people were sentenced, on the basis of the above-mentioned statements, to between 2 and 15 years' imprisonment, and one was given the death penalty. One person was released, having already served the sentence imposed. The other 11 convicted persons are serving their sentences in Roumieh prison, where 58 of the 87 persons arrested are also being held pending trial.

11. In the source's view, these persons' arrest is arbitrary and contrary to article 9, paragraph 1, of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. In particular, the fact that they were detained without a warrant and without being informed of the formal charges against them violates article 9, paragraph 2, of the Covenant. They were taken to the Ministry of Defence and held incommunicado for several days or weeks before being transferred to Roumieh prison. It was only when they were first brought before the investigating judge, after several months of detention without legal justification, that they were informed of the charges against them and the investigating judge retroactively regularized their arrest and pretrial detention by issuing arrest warrants.

12. The source also claims that this situation is contrary to article 9, paragraph 3, of the Covenant as the accused first appeared before the investigating judge only after they had been in detention for several months. The source notes, moreover, that article 108 of the Lebanese Code of Criminal Procedure allows unlimited pretrial detention for certain crimes such as State security offences, which is also contrary to article 9 of the Covenant.

13. The source states that these individuals have not been able to challenge the lawfulness of their arrest or their current detention, in violation of article 9, paragraph 4, of the Covenant. The various remedies attempted by their families and lawyers have been unsuccessful.

14. Moreover, the Human Rights Committee, in its comment No. 32 (2007) on the right to equality before courts and tribunals and to a fair trial, has described proceedings before special courts as "irregular" and not meeting the basic requirements of a fair trial. The source maintains that the Justice Council, which is trying these persons, is a special court competent to try offences against national security or unity, and is therefore contrary to article 14, paragraph 1, of the Covenant. The Justice Council does not have its own inquiry mechanism and bases its decisions on preliminary investigations conducted by other security services, notably the military intelligence services, which means that in many cases confessions extracted under torture are held against the accused. Its decisions are final and not subject to appeal, in violation of the principle of the right to a second hearing.

15. The source argues that being held in pretrial detention for more than five years before indictment, and indeed to this day for 61 of those persons, constitutes a violation of the right of the accused to be tried without undue delay in accordance with article 14, paragraph 3 (c), of the Covenant.

16. Lastly, article 14, paragraph 3 (g), of the Covenant guarantees the right not to be compelled to testify against oneself or to confess guilt. In this regard, confessions obtained

under torture must be systematically disallowed. Moreover, the onus is on the State party to demonstrate that the accused have made their statements voluntarily. The source reports that these people were tortured for several days while being held incommunicado at the Ministry of Defence and that the statements thus contain confessions extracted under torture. As a result, the conviction of 12 people on the basis of these statements, and in the absence of any other material evidence for the prosecution, deprives their detention of any legal basis, thereby rendering it arbitrary. The other 61 people awaiting trial may also be convicted on the basis of these statements.

17. The source points out that the current deprivation of liberty of the persons mentioned in the annex to this communication constitutes a violation of the right to a fair trial and renders their detention arbitrary under category III of the criteria applicable to the consideration of cases submitted to the Working Group.

Response from the Government

18. In a letter dated 25 June 2014, the Working Group transmitted the above allegations to the Government of Lebanon and requested detailed information on the current situation of the 72 individuals in question and clarification of the legal basis justifying their detention.

19. The Working Group finds it regrettable that, to date, the Government has neither replied to the allegations transmitted to it nor requested an extension of the time limit for doing so in accordance with paragraphs 15 and 16 of the Working Group's methods of work.

Discussion

20. Despite the absence of a response from the Government, the Working Group considers that it is in a position to render an opinion on the detention of the persons concerned only on the basis of the information provided by the source, in accordance with paragraph 16 of its methods of work.

21. In the present case, the Government has chosen not to refute the serious prima facie allegations submitted by the source. The Working Group has established in its case law the ways in which it deals with issues of evidence (see, for example, A/HRC/19/57, para. 68). If the source establishes a prima facie case of violation of international obligations amounting to arbitrary detention, the burden of proof must be understood to rest on the Government if it wishes to refute the allegations. Accordingly, the Working Group should base its opinion on the prima facie case established by the source.

22. The Working Group notes with great concern that, with the exception of the person who went voluntarily to the Ministry of Defence, all the people mentioned in this case were arrested en masse by members of the military intelligence services without a warrant, and that warrants were issued later in proceedings based entirely on evidence submitted by members of the military intelligence services.

23. The Working Group is particularly concerned that these individuals were submitted to various forms of torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment, mainly to enable members of the Ministry of Defence to fabricate evidence. It should be noted that some of the victims are unwilling to describe or give details of the torture to which they were subjected, probably through shame or due to psychological trauma. After the torture ended, all the victims were forced to sign statements drawn up by members of the intelligence services, which were later used as the sole source of evidence by both the prosecutors and the Court.

24. The Working Group is also alarmed by the fact that a grave miscarriage of justice has been committed in the handling of the case. The victims' detention was extremely lengthy and their trials have been excessively delayed. Most of the victims were arrested between May and September 2007 and the investigation was completed around December 2007. However, the final indictment was not drawn up until 19 July 2012. Pretrial hearings finally began between February and March 2013 and it was not until 27 September 2013 that the first group of defendants was brought before the Justice Council for the first time.

25. The arrests and detention of the victims were carried out in flagrant violation of article 9, paragraph 1, of the Covenant, which provides that no one shall be subjected to arbitrary arrest or detention and that no one shall be deprived of their liberty except on such grounds and in accordance with such procedure as are established by law. There has also been a violation of article 9, paragraph 2, which provides that an arrested person shall be informed, at the time of arrest, of the reasons for their arrest and shall be notified without delay of any charge brought against them.

26. It is also well established in international law that pretrial detention should be an exceptional measure and must be as short as possible.[1] In its annual report of 2011 (see A/HRC/19/57, paras. 48–58), the Working Group also stressed that pretrial detention should be an exceptional measure. Article 9, paragraph 3, of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights sets forth two cumulative obligations, namely to be promptly brought before a judge within the first days of the deprivation of liberty and to have a judicial decision rendered without undue delays, in the absence of which the person is to be released (see A/HRC/19/57, para. 53).

27. This provision is completed by the second part of paragraph 3 of article 9 which provides that "it shall not be the general rule that persons awaiting trial shall be detained in custody, but release may be subject to guarantees to appear for trial, at any other stage of the judicial proceedings, and, should occasion arise, for execution of the judgement". It follows that liberty is recognized as a principle and detention as an exception in the interests of justice (ibid., para. 54).

28. The provisions contained in article 9, paragraph 3, of the Covenant can be summarized as follows:

> Any detention must be exceptional and of short duration; release may be accompanied by measures intended only to ensure representation of the defendant in judicial proceedings (ibid., para. 56).

29. The Working Group wishes also to refer to the Human Rights Committee's general comment No. 35 (2014), according to which:

> It should not be the general practice to subject defendants to pretrial detention. Detention pending trial must be based on an individualized determination that it is reasonable and necessary taking into account all the circumstances, for such purposes as to prevent flight, interference with evidence or the recurrence of crime. The relevant factors should be specified in law and should not include vague and expansive standards such as "public security". Pretrial detention should not be mandatory for all defendants charged with a particular crime, without regard to individual circumstances.

30. In addition, article 9, paragraph 4, of the Covenant guarantees that anyone deprived of liberty by arrest or detention shall be entitled to take proceedings before a court, in order

[1] See, for example, Human Rights Committee communication No. 1787/2008, Views adopted on 27 March 2013, paras. 7.3 and 7.4.

that the court decide without delay on the lawfulness of detention and order their release if the detention is not lawful. The persons mentioned in this case did not have the opportunity to challenge the lawfulness of their detention or the acts of torture and extraction of false statements while they were held incommunicado. Various appeals lodged by their families and their lawyers were unsuccessful. During the investigation that took place after the arrest and detention in order to provide a basis for the arrest warrants, all appeals were ignored while the reports of the military intelligence services, based on false confessions, were upheld.

31. The Working Group also considers that article 108 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which allows unlimited detention for certain crimes such as State security offences, is also contrary to article 9 of the Covenant.

32. Another concern is that the Justice Council, which is hearing or is to hear the trials in the case at hand, does not meet the necessary conditions to constitute an independent and impartial tribunal. The Council of Ministers decides which cases are to be referred to the Justice Council, contrary to the principles of separation of powers and independence of the judiciary. In addition, the Justice Council is a special court competent to try violations of national security or unity. Its decisions are final and without appeal. In this case, the problems associated with the Justice Council's lack of independence and impartiality are exacerbated by the fact that one of the victims was sentenced to death.

33. In addition, the Justice Council relies entirely on preliminary investigations carried out by other security services, notably the military intelligence services, which means that confessions extracted under torture are often used against the accused without any other corroborating material evidence. Therefore, the trial and conviction of the accused by this court is contrary to article 14, paragraph 1, of the Covenant, which provides that everyone shall be entitled to a fair and public hearing by a competent, independent and impartial tribunal established by law, in the determination of any criminal charge against them, or of their rights and obligations in a suit at law.

34. Given that, in the case of those convicted, sentence was handed down after more than five years in pretrial detention, and that, in the case of the 61 people awaiting trial, pretrial detention continues to this day, the right of the 72 persons currently in detention to be tried without undue delay, in accordance with article 14, paragraph 3 (c), of the Covenant, must be deemed to have been violated. The trial and sentencing of the detainees were also conducted in violation of article 14, paragraph 3 (g), of the Covenant, which guarantees the right not to be compelled to testify against oneself or to confess guilt.

35. In addition, the Working Group wishes to reiterate its concern about the treatment of refugees, immigrants, and foreigners in the country, as indicated in previous opinions (for example, opinions Nos. 2011/14, 2011/55 and 2012/44).

Disposition

36. In the light of the foregoing, the Working Group renders the following opinion:

> The deprivation of liberty of the above-mentioned persons is arbitrary, being in contravention of articles 9, paragraphs 1 to 4, and 14 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, and falls within categories I and III of the criteria applicable to the consideration of cases submitted to the Working Group.

37. Accordingly, the Working Group requests the Lebanese Government to take the necessary measures, without delay, to remedy the situation and bring it into conformity with the standards and principles set forth in the Covenant and other relevant international standards.

38. The Working Group considers that, in light of all the circumstances in the specific case, the proper remedy would be the immediate release of the detainees and the granting of reasonable and appropriate reparation in accordance with article 9, paragraph 5, of the Covenant. Reparation is also due to those who have already served their prison sentences or were released without trial.

39. The Working Group refers the allegations of ill-treatment that have been made and not contested in this case to the Special Rapporteur on the question of torture for appropriate action.

[*Adopted on 21 November 2014*]

	Name	*Name in Arabic*	*Nationality*	*Year of birth*	*Place of birth*	*Address*	*Date of arrest*
1	**Mohammed Ali Najem**	محمد علي نجم	Palestinian Syrian	1980	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	10/02/2007
2	**Khodor Soleiman Al-Meree/ Mother's name: Wardeh**	خضر سليمان المرعي	Lebanese	1974	Wadi Khaled [Akkar, Northern Lebanon]	Wadi Khaled	19/05/2007
3	**Mahmoud Medhat Al-Andouri**	محمود مدحت اندوري	Lebanese	1985	Banyas	Tripoli	25/05/2007
4	**Bilal Ahmed Ismail Al Masri**	بلال أحمد إسماعيل المصري	Lebanese	1987	Tripoli	Tripoli	13/06/2007
5	**Talal Adul Rahman Radwan**	طلال عبدالرحمان رضوان	Lebanese	1978	Tripoli	Tripoli	02/07/2007
6	**Amer Mustafa Al-Jasem**	عامر مصطفى الجاسم	Lebanese	1978	Tripoli	Tripoli	02/07/2007
7	**Ahmed Ali Kobeiter**	أحمد علي قبيطر	Lebanese	1978	Qalmon/Tripoli	Qalmon	05/07/2007
8	**Yaser Na'eem Hasan**	ياسر نعيم حسن	Palestinian	1975	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	07/07/2007
9	**Jihad Saeed Mawed/ Mother's name: Fatima**	جهاد سعيد موعد	Palestinian	1972	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	11/07/2007
10	**Ziad Jamil Badran/ Mother's name: Aziza**	زياد جميل بدران	Palestinian	1984	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	11/07/2007
11	**Simon Ahmed Ibrahim/ Mother's name: Soumayeh**	سيمون أحمد إبراهيم	Palestinian	1973	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	11/07/2007
12	**Firas Mohammed Awad/ Mother's name: Aminah**	فراس محمد عوض	Palestinian	1983	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	11/07/2007
13	**Moueen Badei Wehbe**	معين بديع وهبي	Palestinian	1961	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	11/07/2007
14	**Nizar Ahmed Al-Ashkar**	نزار أحمد الأشقر	Palestinian	1970	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	11/07/2007
15	**Mohammed Souleiman Merei**	محمد سليمان المرعي	Lebanese	1968	Wadi Khaled	Nahr al Bared Camp	20/07/2007

	Name	*Name in Arabic*	*Nationality*	*Year of birth*	*Place of birth*	*Address*	*Date of arrest*
16	**Mohammed Jamil Kasim/ Mother's name: Zahiyeh**	محمد جميل قاسم	Palestinian	1982	Kuwait	Nahr al Bared Camp	20/07/2007
17	**Wisam Jamil Badran/ Mother's name: Aziza**	وسام جميل بدران	Palestinian	1976	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	20/07/2007
18	**Mohammed Moueen Wehbe/ Mother's name: Khadija**	محمد معين وهبي	Palestinian	1986	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	25/07/2007
19	**Yousof Saleh Al-Moghrabi/ Mother's name: Fatima**	يوسف صالح المغربي	Palestinian	1968	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	27/07/2007
20	**Jamaluddeen Mustafa Malas**	جمال الدين مصطفى ملص	Lebanese	1977	Minieh	Tripoli	29/08/2007
21	**Mohamed Mahmoud Shaaban**	محمد محمود شعبان	Lebanese	1986	Sidon	Sidon	29/08/2007
22	**Mohammed Kasim Al-Saadi**	محمد قاسم السعدي	Palestinian	1971	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	30/08/2007
23	**Basheer Bin Mohammed Al-Tayyeb Al-Armani**	بشير بن محمد الطيب الأرماني	Tunisian	1985	Joemin/Benzart	Nahr al Bared Camp	28/09/2007
24	**Husam Fouad Khalil**	حسام فؤاد خليل	Palestinian	1980	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	28/09/2007
25	**Mohammed Khalaf Mohammed Al-Jabri**	محمد خلف محمد الجابري	Omani	1984	Sultanate of Oman	Nahr al Bared Camp	28/09/2007
26	**Nasru-deen Oddah Balkayim**	نصرالدين عدة بلقايم	Algerian	1986	State of Teyyarat/ Algeria	Nahr al Bared Camp	28/09/2007
27	**Mohammed Hamzeh Al-Sheikh Othman**	محمد حمزة الشيخ عثمان	Syrian	1986	Homs	Nahr al Bared Camp	28/09/2007
28	**Ahmed Hasan Al-Labash**	أحمد حسن اللبش	Syrian	1979	Dara	Nahr al Bared Camp	28/09/2007
29	**Ahmed Ali Ahmed**	أحمد علي أحمد	Palestinian	1983	El-Mina/Tripoli	Beddawi Camp	02/10/2007
30	**Husein Hasan Al-Latif**	حسين حسن اللطيف	Syrian	1986	Abu Kamal/Syria	Nahr al Bared Camp	02/10/2007

	Name	Name in Arabic	Nationality	Year of birth	Place of birth	Address	Date of arrest
31	**Amer Salem Souleiman Al-Seirai**	عامر سالم سليمان السعيري	Saudi	1985	Sharoura	Nahr al Bared Camp	02/10/2007
32	**Mubarak Naji Amer Al-Korbi**	مبارك ناجي عامر الكربي	Saudi	1986	Najran/Sharorah	Nahr al Bared Camp	02/10/2007
33	**Nasser Mohammed Shiba**	ناصر محمد شيبة	Yemeni	1983	Najran, Saudi Arabia	Nahr al Bared Camp	02/10/2007
34	**Ezz al-Din Abdul Qadir Bin Musa**	عز الدين عبد القادر بن موسى	Algerian	1975	Hussein Dey	Nahr al Bared Camp	02/10/2007
35	**Fathi Bin Nasr Bin Hasan Al-Asadi**	فتحي بن ناصر الحسن العصادي	Tunisian	1982	Welad Bo Afeia Kesra	Nahr al Bared Camp	02/10/2007
36	**Ashraf Yousuf Abu Zeinab**	أشرف يوسف أبو زينب	Syrian	1987	Latakia [Syria]	Nahr al Bared Camp	02/10/2007
37	**Abdallah Saaduddeen Shukri**	عبدالله سعدالدين شكري	Syrian	1986	Latakia [Syria]	Nahr al Bared Camp	04/10/2007
38	**Ahmed Zakaria Al-Sheikh**	أحمد زكريا الشيخ	Origin: Syrian Palestinian	1979	Syria	Nahr al Bared Camp	26/10/2007
39	**Ahmed Bassam Kasem**	أحمد بسام قاسم	Origin: Syrian Palestinian	1985	Sayda Zeinab/ Damascus	Nahr al Bared Camp	26/10/2007
40	**Ahmed Kayed Habbous**	أحمد كايد حبوس	Palestinian	1986	Tyre	Nahr al Bared Camp	26/10/2007
41	**Ayedh Moubarak AL-Kahtani**	عايض مبارك القحطاني	Saudi	1985	Riyadh	Nahr al Bared Camp	26/10/2007
42	**Munir Ahmed Mohamed**	منير احمد محمد	Palestinian	1980	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	26/10/2007
43	**Ezzeddene Abdul-Kader Bin Mousa**	عزالدين عبدالقادر بن موسى	Algerian	1975	Algeria	Nahr al Bared Camp	27/10/2007
44	**Khalid Ahmed Awad**	خالد أحمد عوض	Syrian Palestinian	1981	Al-Ae'deen camp/ Hama/Syria	Nahr al Bared Camp	31/10/2007
45	**Talal Moslim Saleh Al-Seiari**	طلال مسلم صليع الصعيري	Saudi	1984	Sharoura	Saudi Arabia	31/10/2007

	Name	Name in Arabic	Nationality	Year of birth	Place of birth	Address	Date of arrest
46	**Mohammed Ahmed Yasine**	محمد أحمد ياسين	Palestinian	1987	Yarmouk Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	31/10/2007
47	**Nizar Farouk Al-Hasan**	نزار فاروق الحسن	Syrian	1988	Aleppo [Syria]	Nahr al Bared Camp	31/10/2007
48	**Hamza Daham Qwaider**	حمزة دحام قويدر	Syrian	1983	Hama	Nahr al Bared Camp	31/10/2007
49	**Mohamed Hussein Rahal**	محمد حسين رحال	Syrian	1972	Idlib	Nahr al Bared Camp	31/10/2007
50	**Sergei Vladimir Fssonatski**	سرغاي فلاديمير فيسوتسكي	Russian	1989	Nalchik	Nahr al Bared Camp	10/11/2007
51	**Szenasi Iadhikar Aceh**	شيناسي يادبكار آتش	German	1982	Boslar	Nahr al Bared Camp	10/11/2007
52	**Fadi Adel Khalid**	فادي عادل خالد	Palestinian	1972	Beirut	Nahr al Bared Camp	10/11/2007
53	**Mohammed Mahil Al-Mteiri**	محمد محيل المطيري	Saudi	1983	Qassim/Buraida	Nahr al Bared Camp	10/11/2007
54	**Taha Ahmed Hadji-Souleiman**	طه أحمد حجي سليمان	Syrian	1982	Latakia [Syria]	Nahr al Bared Camp	10/11/2007
55	**Adnan Khodor Najjar**	عدنان خضر نجار	Palestinian	1983	Beirut Al-Mazra'a	Nahr al Bared Camp	10/11/2007
56	**Naser Ahmed Ismail**	ناصر أحمد إسماعيل	Palestinian	1961	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	15/01/2008
57	**Obeida Ali Tawele**	عبيدة علي طويلة	Palestinian	1984	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	13/02/2008
58	**Nader Ahmad Al Qasem**	نادر أحمد القاسم	Palestinian	1982	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	15/04/2008
59	**Alaa Saleh Aref Haj Mahmoud**	علاء صالح عارف الحاج محمود	Palestinian	1983	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	26/04/2008

	Name	*Name in Arabic*	*Nationality*	*Year of birth*	*Place of birth*	*Address*	*Date of arrest*
60	**Raafat Fouad Al-Khalil**	رأفت فؤاد خليل	Palestinian	1979	Nahr al Bared Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	25/04/2009
61	**Salim Ali Abdul-Karim Saleh**	سليم علي عبدالكريم صالح	Yemeni	1983	Aden	Nahr al Bared Camp	28/09/2007
62	**Bilal Khodor Ibrahim**	بلال خضر إبراهيم	Lebanese	1983	Sheikh-Taba/ Akkar	Tripoli	30/04/2007
63	**Zakaria Abdul-Manaf Khodor**	زكريا عبدالمناف خضر	Lebanese	1976	Deddeh/ Northern Lebanon	Tripoli	04/05/2007
64	**Ahmed Fayez Safarjelani/ Mother's name: Nadia**	أحمد فايز سفرجلاني	Lebanese	1979	Tripoli	Tripoli	25/05/2007
65	**Abdul Razzaq Mohammed Al-Ali/Mother's name: Rajaa**	عبد الرزاق محمد العلي	Lebanese	1979	Eyat/Akkar	Tripoli	05/06/2007
66	**Fayez Mohammed Abadan/ Mother's name: Souad**	فايز محمد عبدان	Lebanese	1965	Beirut Al-Mazra'a	Beirut Al-Mazra'a	08/06/2007
67	**Othman Mohammed Ibrahim**	عثمان محمد إبراهيم	Lebanese	1978	Al-Mankoubin/ Al-Baddawi/ Tripoli	Tripoli	11/06/2007
68	**Abdul-Kadir Mustafa Sanjakdar/ Mother's name: Najah**	عبدالقادر مصطفى سنجقدار	Lebanese	1964	Tripoli	Tripoli	13/06/2007
69	**Ahmad Souleiman Merei**	أحمد سليمان مرعي	Lebanese	1981	Wadi Khaled	Nahr al Bared Camp	20/07/2007
70	**Younis Khalid Shibli**	يونس خالد شبلي	Palestinian	1987	Sidon	Tameer district	29/08/2007
71	**Nouri Nasr Al-Mahmoud Al-Hadji**	نوري نصر المحمود الحجي	Syrian	1981	Hama	Nahr al Bared Camp	10/11/2007
72	**Muhammed Salih Al-Zawawi**	محمد صالح زواوي	Palestinian	1972	Yarmouk Camp	Nahr al Bared Camp	15/01/2008